PRELIMINARY RESULTS

## For more information see the second page in either the PDF or Excel file T09-0436

http://www.taxpolicycenter.org

1	Employee and Employer Payments Under Proposed Subsidy Exchange in Senate Finance Bill Individual, 2016																							
	Health Care Payments				Direct Subsidies Provided by Government				E	Employee T	ax Payments	Employee Totals						Employer Payments						
												Cash Income +												Percent of Cash and
				Average Value	e Senate Finance							Cash Income + Direct Gov't												Health
				of Cost Share	Committee							Subsidies +												Benefits/
			Value of Silver Plan	(paid by	proposed Percent							Employer	Health Care	F	ayments	Net After-tax		Health Care						Subsidies
			Premium (paid by	employee	of Income		Value of	Value of Cost	Pa	yroll Taxes		Provided Health	Costs Paid by	1	made by	After-health		Benefits			Payroll Tax	es Tc	otal Cost to	Spent on
	Compensati	on:	employee using	using subsidy	allocated to		Subsidy	Share Subsidy		paid by	Paid by	Benefits	Employee		Employee	cost Income		Provided by		ployer	Paid by	F	Employer	Health Care
FPL <sup>1</sup>	Cash Incon	1e <sup>2</sup>	subsidy received)	received)	Premium	R	eceived	Received	e	employee	Employee	(B+F+G+O)	(C+D-F-G-O)	(	(H+I+K)	(J-L-F-G-O)	Cash Income	Employer		nalty <sup>6</sup>	Employer	(N	(+O+P+Q)	((C+D)/J)
(A)	(B)		(C)	(D)	(E)		(F)	(G)		(H)	(I)	(J)	(K)		(L)	(M)	(N)	(0)		(P)	(Q)		(R)	(S)
100		,800	\$ 5,000		2.10%	\$	4,752			903	\$ (50)	+			1,601	\$ 10,19			\$	400	\$ 90		13,103	37.74%
125		,700		\$ 1,700	3.40%	\$	4,500	, ,	\$	1,125		\$ 20,400	\$ 1,000		2,580	\$ 12,12			\$	400	\$ 1,12		16,225	32.84%
150		,700		\$ 1,700	4.80%	\$	4,150	\$ 1,200	\$	1,354	\$ 755	\$ 23,050	\$ 1,350		3,459	\$ 14,24		\$ -	\$	400	\$ 1,35		19,454	29.07%
175		,600		\$ 1,700	6.31%	\$	3,700		\$	1,576	. , .		\$ 2,300	\$	4,988	\$ 15,612		s -	\$	400	\$ 1,57		22,576	26.80%
200		,600		\$ 1,700 \$ 1,700	7.50%	\$	3,230	1	\$	1,805	\$ 1,563	\$ 27,530 \$ 29,200	\$ 2,770	\$	6,138	\$ 17,46		\$ - ¢	\$	400 400	\$ 1,80		25,805	24.34% 22.95%
225 250		,500 .500		\$ 1,700 \$ 1.700	8.68% 10.10%	\$	2,700 2,021	s -	\$	2,027	\$ 1,998 \$ 2,448	\$ 29,200 \$ 31.521	\$ 4,000 \$ 4,680	\$	8,025 9,384	\$ 18,47 \$ 20,11			\$	400	\$ 2,02 \$ 2,25		28,927 32,157	22.95%
250		,500 ,400		\$ 1,700 \$ 1.700	11.42%	\$	1,300	<b>&gt;</b> -	\$	2,257	. , .		\$ 4,680 \$ 5,400	\$	9,384 10,761	\$ 20,110			\$	400	\$ 2,25 \$ 2.47		32,157	19.88%
300		,400 .400		\$ 1,700 \$ 1.700	11.42%	s e	1,300	s - s -	\$	2,479	\$ 2,883 \$ 3,333	\$ 33,700 \$ 35,869	\$ 5,400 \$ 6,231	\$ \$	12,272	\$ 23,12			s c	400	\$ 2,47 \$ 2,70		35,279	19.88%
325		.300		\$ 1,700	12.80%	ф ¢	98	э - с	ф ¢	2,708	\$ 3,353 \$ 3,768	\$ 38,398	\$ 6,602	e e	13,300	\$ 25,00			ф с	400	\$ 2,93		41.630	17.45%
350		.300		\$ 1,700	12.80%	s S	- 38	s -	s s	3.159	\$ 4,218	\$ 41,300	\$ 6,700	s	13,300	\$ 27,22			ŝ	400	\$ 3.15		44.859	16.22%
375		.200		\$ 1,700	12.80%	ŝ	_	\$ -	ŝ	3,381	\$ 4.653	\$ 44,200	\$ 6,700	s	14,734	\$ 29,46			ŝ	400	\$ 3.38		47,981	15.16%
400		,200		\$ 1,700	12.80%	ŝ	_	\$ -	ŝ	3,611	\$ 5,113	\$ 47,200	\$ 6,700	s	15,423	\$ 31,77			ŝ	400	\$ 3.61		51,211	14.19%
425		.100		\$ 1,700	n/a	ŝ	-	s -	\$	3,833	\$ 5,838	\$ 50,100	\$ 6,700	s	16,370	\$ 33,73		s -	ŝ	400	\$ 3.83		54.333	13.37%
450		,100		\$ 1,700	n/a	\$	-	\$ -	\$	4,062	\$ 6,588	\$ 53,100	\$ 6,700		17,350	\$ 35,75		\$ -	\$	400	\$ 4,06		57,562	12.62%

	Employee and Employer Payments Under Current Health System																				
										Iı	ndividual, 2016										
			Health Care F	ayments	Direct Subsidies Provided by Government			Em	ployee T	ax Payments	Employee Totals					Employer Payments					
																					Percent of
											Cash Income +										Cash and
					Senate Finance						Direct Gov't										Health
					Committee						Subsidies +										Benefits/
					ie proposed Percent						Employer	Health Care	Payments	Net After-tax		Health Care					Subsidies
			Value of Silver Plan	of Cost Sha		Value of	Value of Cost			Income Tax	Provided Health	Costs Paid by	made by	after-health		Benefits	Maximum			Fotal Cost to	Spent on
	_	7	Premium (paid by	(paid by	allocated to	Subsidy	Share Subsidy	1	aid by	Paid by	Benefits	Employee	Employee	cost Income8	7	Provided by	Employer	paid by		Employer	Health Care
FPL	Ca	ash Income <sup>7</sup>	employer)	employee	Premium	Received Received		employee		Employee	(B+F+G+O)	(C+D-F-G-O) (H+I+K)			Cash Income <sup>7</sup>	Employer Penalty		Employer		(N+O+P+Q)	((C+D)/J)
(A)'		(B)'	(C)'	(D)'	(E)'	(F)'	(G)'	-	(H)'	(I)'	(J)'	(K)'	(L)'	(M)'	(N)'	(O)'	(P)'	(Q)'		(R)'	(S)'
100	\$	7,527	\$ 5,000	\$ 1,70		\$ -	\$ -	\$	576	\$ (496)	\$ 12,527						\$ -		76	\$ 13,103	53.48%
125	\$	10,427	\$ 5,000	\$ 1,70		s -	s -	\$	798	\$ (292)	\$ 15,427						s -		98	\$ 16,225	43.43%
150	\$	13,427	\$ 5,000	\$ 1,70		s -	s -	\$	1,027	\$ 237	\$ 18,427		. ,				s -	\$ 1,0		\$ 19,454	36.36%
175	\$	16,327	\$ 5,000	\$ 1,70		s -	s -	\$	1,249 1,479	\$ 618	\$ 21,327						s -		49	\$ 22,576	31.42%
200	\$	19,327	\$ 5,000	\$ 1,70		s -	\$ -	\$	-,	\$ 922	\$ 24,327		. ,				s -		79	\$ 25,805	27.54%
225	\$	22,227	\$ 5,000	\$ 1,70		s -	\$ -	\$	1,700	\$ 1,357	\$ 27,227		. ,			\$ 5,000			00	\$ 28,927	24.61%
250 275	\$	25,227	\$ 5,000 \$ 5,000	\$ 1,70 \$ 1.70		s -	\$ - ¢	\$ \$	1,930	\$ 1,807	\$ 30,227					\$ 5,000 \$ 5,000	\$ - ¢		30	\$ 32,157 \$ 35,279	22.17% 20.23%
	\$	28,127	\$ 5,000 \$ 5,000	\$ 1,70 \$ 1.70		\$ - ¢	5 - ¢	\$	2,152	\$ 2,242	\$ 33,127 \$ 26,127			. ,			<b>&gt;</b> -	\$ 2,1		,	20.23% 18.55%
300 325	\$ ¢	31,127 34,027	\$ 5,000 \$ 5,000	\$ 1,70 \$ 1.70		\$ - ¢	5 - ¢	\$	2,381 2,603	\$ 2,692 \$ 3,127	\$ 36,127 \$ 39,027		\$ 6,773 \$ 7,430				s - s -	\$ 2,3 \$ 2,6		\$ 38,508 \$ 41,630	18.55%
325	ф с	34,027	\$ 5,000 \$ 5,000	\$ 1,70 \$ 1.70		5 - ¢	а - с	5 5	2,605	\$ 3,127 \$ 3,577	\$ 39,027 \$ 42,027						Ψ	\$ 2,6		\$ 41,650 \$ 44.859	17.17%
375	ф с	37,027 39,927	\$ 5,000 \$ 5,000	\$ 1,70 \$ 1.70		5 - ¢	а - с	э с	2,855	\$ 3,577 \$ 4,012	\$ 42,027 \$ 44,927		,				5 - ¢	\$ 2,8		\$ 44,859 \$ 47,981	15.94%
375 400	ф ¢	39,927 42,927	\$ 5,000 \$ 5,000	\$ 1,70 \$ 1.70		s - s -	э - с	ф с	3,054	\$ 4,012 \$ 4,462	\$ 44,927 \$ 47.927		\$ 8,760 \$ 9,445			\$ 5,000 \$ 5,000	э - с	\$ 3,0		\$ 47,981 \$ 51,211	13.98%
400	ф ¢	42,927 45,827	\$ 5,000	\$ 1,70		s - s -	ф -	s s	3,284	\$ 4,462 \$ 4.897	\$ 47,927 \$ 50,827					\$ 5,000	s -	\$ 3,2		\$ 51,211 \$ 54.333	13.18%
425	ŝ	43,827	\$ 5,000	\$ 1,70		s -	\$ -	ŝ	3,735	\$ 4,897 \$ 5,519	\$ 53,827						Ψ	\$ 3,5		\$ 57,562	12.45%

1) FPL - Federal poverty level

2)Cash income calculated according to CBO projections of the Federal Poverty Level in 2016.

3)The value of the subsidy is equal to the average price of the Silver Plan (\$5,000) less the share of income allocated to the premium.

4) Average cost share subsidy applied to all income levels within a given FPL range as shown in CBO Analysis of Subsidies and Enrollee Payments, October 9, 2009

5) Income tax calculated using the Urban-Brookings Tax Policy Center Microsimulation Model (version 0509-3). Calendar year. Baseline is an Administration baseline, which extends all of the individual income tax provisions included in 2001 EGTRRA and 2003 JGTRRA; extends the 2009 AMT Patch and indexes the AMT exemption, rate bracket threshold, and phase-out exemption threshold for inflation. Assumes wages and salary is the only type of income for all tax units. Single individual with no dependents who is under age 65. The individual claims the standard deduction; the only credit claimed is the EITC if applicable.

6) Assumes that all employers have over 50 employees and are subject to employer penalty for not providing health insurance. Also assumes employers are not eligible for small employee tax credit.

7) Cash income is calculated assuming the same total cost to employers under the two scenarios, adjusting for the value of the premium, the value of the employer penalty, and lower employer taxes under the current plan.

8) Assumes employee bears the average cost share amount as indicated in column C.

9-Nov-09

## HEALTH REFORM: COMPARING VALUES IN A TWO-SUBSIDY SYSTEM

In many health reform proposals, a new subsidy would be provided for those purchasing health insurance whose income falls below a certain income level. At the same time, those who receive employer-provided health insurance could not receive the new subsidy, but would be eligible for existing tax subsidies. These existing subsidies derive from the exclusion from income and Social Security tax of employer-provided payments.

The figures in the related tables show the difference in subsidies for health care between the employer-provided health insurance system, and the subsidy system currently under consideration by the Senate Finance Committee. The new subsidy would be provided in addition to the employee's compensation (which for these purposes is assumed to be all cash). Households with lower earnings receive a larger subsidy and pay a lower percentage of their income on health care, but no household pays more than 12.8% of their cash income on health care.

The net savings represents the difference between the two levels of subsidy. In these tables the amount of health insurance and the amount of cost share under the policy are assumed to be the same and are made to match an assumed policy used in a number of Congressional Budget Office analyses. The net saving for those receiving the new subsidy relative to the old, but remaining, subsidy equals the sum of the difference in taxes, the difference in direct subsidies and the difference in employer penalties. The net savings would fall somewhat for employers offering more generous plans, although the plan assumed here would cost employers \$14,700 for a family policy in 2016.

In the examples, comparisons are made between employees generating the same employer cost. Employer cost includes cash wages plus employer payments for insurance, plus employer Social Security taxes on compensation paid, plus any penalty under the new law for not providing health insurance. The example does not include other changes, such as to Welfare, Food Stamps or Medicaid, which would apply especially at lower-income levels. Other assumptions are listed in footnotes to the table.